



(Unapproved and subject to change)

**CALIFORNIA FAIR POLITICAL PRACTICES COMMISSION**

**MINUTES OF HEARING, Public Session**

**Thursday, March 17 2016**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Remke called the meeting to order at 10:00 am on March 17, 2016, at the Fair Political Practices Commission, 428 J Street, Sacramento, CA 95814. Chair Remke and Commissioners Audero, Wasserman, and Wynne were present. Commissioner Casher was absent.

**WELCOME**

**1. Public Comment**

No public comment.

**2. Approval of February 2016 Commission Hearing Minutes.**

Commissioner Wynne made a motion to approve item 2, Commissioner Audero seconded the motion.

Ayes: Commissioners Audero, Wasserman, Wynne, and Chair Remke  
The motion passed 4 to 0.

**CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS 3 – 28**

**ENFORCEMENT MATTERS**

Chief of Enforcement Galena West provided an update of the discouragement of funds *In the Matter of Friends of Janet Ngyuen*.

Commissioner Wynne asked a question about why item 9 did not receive the maximum fine for a particularly egregious case. Chief West said that in regards to defaults, when there is no compliance at all, the maximum fee is fined. Although belated, here there was some compliance.

No public comment on consent calendar items.

Commissioner Wynne made a motion to approve items 3-28 of the consent calendar;  
Commissioner Audero seconded the motion.

Ayes: Commissioners Audero, Wasserman, Wynne, and Chair Remke.  
The motion passed 4 to 0.

### **Illegal Campaign Committee Coordination**

- 3. In the Matter of Patrick J. Furey, Pat Furey for Mayor 2014, Torrance Voters PAC to Support Pat Furey for Mayor 2014, Richard Roesch, and Tina McKinnor; FPPC Case No. 14/1118.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Neal Bucknell and Special Investigator Paul Rasey. Patrick J. Furey was a successful candidate for Mayor of Torrance in the June 3, 2014 Primary Election. Pat Furey for Mayor 2014 was his candidate controlled committee. Torrance Voters PAC to Support Pat Furey for Mayor 2014 was a recipient committee, which was wholly funded by McCormick Ambulance and the Torrance Firefighters PAC. The principal officer and the treasurer of Torrance Voters PAC were Richard Roesch and Tina McKinnor. Also, Roesch was President of McCormick Ambulance. On or about May 13 and 17, 2014, Torrance Voters PAC made non-monetary contributions to the Furey campaign totaling approximately \$35,000. These payments were improperly reported by the PAC as independent expenditures. Roesch, McKinnor, and the PAC were required to report the making of these contributions by filing a Form 497 within 24 hours of making each contribution, and they were required to report the contributions on a preelection campaign statement filed for the period ending May 17, 2014, but they failed to do so, in violation of Government Code Sections 84203, subdivisions (a) and (b) (2 counts); and 84211, subdivisions (b), (i), and (k) (1 count). Furey and his committee were required to report receipt of the contributions by filing a Form 497 within 48 hours of each contribution, and they were required to report the contributions on a preelection campaign statement filed for the period ending May 17, 2014, but they failed to do so, in violation of Government Code Sections 84203, subdivisions (a) and (b), and 84203.3, subdivision (b) (2 counts); as well as Section 84211, subdivisions (a), (c), and (f) (1 count). Also, on campaign statements filed for the periods ending May 17, 2014 and June 30, 2014, Roesch, McKinnor, and the PAC failed to report required information about payments to subvendors, in violation of Government Code Sections 84211, subdivision (k), and 84303 (1 count). Additionally, on campaign statements filed for the periods ending March 17, 2014 and May 17, 2014, Furey and his committee failed to report information regarding payments made to subvendors, in violation of Government Code Section 84211, subdivision (k), and 84303 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$35,000.**

### **Laundered Campaign Contributions**

- 4. In the Matter of Stanislaus Republican Central Committee (State Acct.), and Gary McKinsey; FPPC No. 16/178.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Angela Brereton and

Special Investigator Jeffrey Kamigaki. Stanislaus Republican Central Committee (State Acct.), also known as Stanislaus County Republican Party (SCRCP), was a political party committee located in Modesto, CA. Gary McKinsey was the treasurer for SCRCP. Anthony A. “Tony” Strickland served in the California Legislature for ten years. Strickland was an unsuccessful candidate for California State Controller in the November 2, 2010 General Election. Strickland for Controller 2010 was Strickland’s candidate controlled committee. In 2010, SCRCP made a \$20,000 contribution to Strickland for Controller. However SCRCP was not the true source of the contribution, and the true sources of the contribution were concealed. The parties violated the Act as follows: SCRCP and McKinsey, while acting as the intermediary for two persons, failed to disclose both the intermediary and the original contributor information for \$20,000 in contributions from the persons in violation of Government Code Section 84302 (1 count); and filed an erroneous campaign statement for the reporting period of October 17, 2010 through November 20, 2010, which failed to disclose the true source by erroneously reporting that SCRCP made \$20,000 in contributions to Strickland for Controller, when it was not the true source of the contributions and was the intermediary for the transactions, in violation of Government Code Section 84211, subdivision (k) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$10,000.**

### **Mass Mailings**

- 5. In the Matter of Phillips 66; FPPC No. 16/111.** Staff: Assistant Chief of Enforcement Dave Bainbridge and Special Investigator Simon Russell. Phillips 66 is a corporation based in Houston, Texas. Phillips 66 owned and operated an oil and gas terminal in the City of Rialto. Prior to the 2012 General Election in Rialto, Phillips 66 paid for and caused to be sent a mass mailing opposing Measure V, a proposed tax increase on oil companies operating in Rialto, which failed to display required sender identification and instead identified a general purpose committee, Californians for Good Schools and Good Jobs, as the sender, in violation of Government Code Section 84305, subdivision (a), and California Code of Regulations, title 2, section 18435, subdivision (d) (2 counts). In addition, Phillips 66 failed to timely disclose costs associated with those mass mailings on a semiannual campaign statement, in violation of Government Code Section 84211, subdivision (k) (1 count) and failed to timely disclose late independent expenditures, in violation of Government Code Section 84204, subdivision (a) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$16,000.**

### **Campaign Reporting**

- 6. In the Matter of Patricia López, Patty López for Assembly 2014, and Carolina Perez; FPPC Nos. 15/313 and 15/314.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Angela Brereton, Special Investigator Paul Rasey, and Program Specialist Soni Mangat. Patricia

López was a successful candidate for Assembly District 39 in the June 3, 2014 Primary Election, and in the November 4, 2014 General Election. Patty López for Assembly 2014 was her candidate controlled committee. At all relevant times, Carolina Perez was the treasurer of the Committee. López, Patty López for Assembly 2014, and Perez failed to timely file one semiannual campaign statement and two preelection campaign statements for reporting periods in 2014 by the applicable due dates, in violation of Government Code Sections 84200, subdivision (a), 84200.5, subdivision (a), and 84200.7, subdivision (b) (1 count); failed to deposit contributions into a single, designated campaign bank account prior to expenditure, in violation of Government Code Sections 85201, subdivisions (c) and (e) (1 count); received cash contributions of \$100 or more totaling approximately \$1,300, and made cash expenditures of \$100 or more, totaling approximately \$1,220, in violation of Government Code Section 84300, subdivisions (a) and (b) (1 count); failed to maintain supporting records for contributions and loans received and expenditures made, in violation of Government Code Section 84104 (1 count); López failed to disclose required economic interests of real property and income in her Candidate Statement of Economic Interests, in violation of Government Code Sections 87206 and 87207 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$7,500.**

- 7. In the Matter of Kenneth Hughey, Hughey 4 Judge 2012, and Harbor Financial Services, Inc.; FPPC Case Nos. 14/601 and 14/1318.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Neal Bucknell, Commission Counsel Milad Dalju, and Program Specialist Soni Mangat. This matter arose from an audit performed by the Political Reform Audit Program of the Franchise Tax Board. In 2012, Kenneth Hughey was an unsuccessful candidate for Los Angeles County Superior Court Judge. His controlled committee was Hughey 4 Judge 2012. Harbor Financial Services, Inc. qualified as a major donor committee in support of Hughey's candidacy. Harbor Financial Services made a loan to Hughey in the amount of \$50,000 for political purposes. Hughey deposited the check into his business account and then wrote a check in the same amount to his controlled committee. On or about March 22, 2012, Hughey filed a preelection campaign statement on behalf of Hughey 4 Judge 2012. The loan was disclosed on the filing, but instead of reporting that the true source of the loan was Harbor Financial Services, the loan was disclosed as a personal loan from Hughey to his own committee. No mention was made of Harbor Financial Services, in violation of Government Code Sections 84211, subdivisions (f) and (g), and 84216 (1 count). Also, Harbor Financial Services failed to file a major donor semiannual campaign statement for the reporting period of January 1, 2012 through June 30, 2012, in violation of Government Code Section 84200, subdivision (b) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$6,500.**
- 8. In the Matter of Barry Chang, Barry Chang for City Council 2014, Sue Chang, Barry Chang for Assembly 2014, and John Bartas; FPPC No. 14/1275.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Zachary W. Norton and Special Investigator Jay Martin. Barry

Chang was a successful candidate for re-election to the Cupertino City Council in the November 4, 2014 General Election. Barry Chang also ran unsuccessfully for Assembly in the June 3, 2014 Primary Election. Barry Chang, Barry Chang for City Council 2014, and Sue Chang failed to disclose on campaign statements 160 contributions received totaling \$24,280 and occupation and employer information for approximately 35 individual contributors, in violation of Government Code Section 84211, subdivisions (a), (c), and (f) (1 count), and Barry Chang, Barry Chang for Assembly 2014, and John Bartas failed to disclose on campaign statements occupation and employer information for approximately 231 individual contributors, in violation of Government Code Section 84211, subdivision (f) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$3,500.**

### **Campaign Non-Filer**

- 9. In the Matter of Vallejo Citizens Deserve Better and Richard Grant; FPPC No. 13/1132. (Default Decision)** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Bridgette Castillo, Commission Counsel Tanya Smith, and Special Investigator Jeffrey Kamigaki. Richard Grant and his primarily formed committee, Vallejo Citizens Deserve Better, opposed three Vallejo City Council candidates running in the November 5, 2013 General Election. Grant and Vallejo Citizens Deserve Better failed to: file a late independent expenditure report by October 17, 2013, in violation of Government Code Section 84204 (1 count); timely file a semiannual campaign statement for the period October 20, 2013 through December 31, 2013, in violation of Government Code Section 84200 (1 count); and file a semiannual campaign statement for the period of January 1, 2014 through June 30, 2014, in violation of Government Code Section 84200 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$11,500.**
- 10. In the Matter of John Brosnan and John Brosnan for District 3 Supervisor 2014; FPPC No. 14/1387.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Angela Brereton and Special Investigator Paul Rasey. John Brosnan was a successful candidate in the June 3, 2014 Primary Election and an unsuccessful candidate in the November 4, 2014 General Election for Lake County Supervisor. John Brosnan for District 3 Supervisor 2014 was Brosnan's candidate controlled committee. At all relevant times, Brosnan was treasurer of the Committee. Brosnan and the Committee failed to file four preelection campaign statements and one semiannual campaign statement by the applicable due dates in 2014, in violation of Government Code Sections 84200, subdivision (a), 84200.5, subdivision (a), and 84200.7, subdivisions (a) and (b) (1 count); and received cash contributions of \$100 or more totaling \$5,000, in violation of Government Code Section 84300, subdivision (a) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$4,000.**

- 11. In the Matter of California Society of Enrolled Agents Political Action Committee, Cap Porterfield and Don Stacy; FPPC No. 14/1361.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Bridgette Castillo. California Society of Enrolled Agents Political Action Committee is a state general purpose committee. Cap Porterfield was the committee treasurer from August 1, 2011 through August 2, 2012. Don Stacy was the committee treasurer from August 3, 2012 through July 21, 2013. California Society of Enrolled Agents Political Action Committee and Porterfield failed to file a preelection campaign statement for the reporting period of January 1, 2012, through March 17, 2012, and the committee and Stacy failed to file a preelection campaign statement for the reporting period of July 1, 2012 through September 30, 2012, in violation of Government Code Sections 84200.5 and 84200.7, subdivision (a)(1) and (b)(1) (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$2,500.**
- 12. In the Matter of Mike Boudreaux and Friends of Mike Boudreaux for Sheriff 2014; FPPC No. 15/1312.** Staff: Commission Counsel Zachary W. Norton and Program Specialist Patricia Ballantyne. Mike Boudreaux was a successful candidate for Tulare County Sheriff in the June 3, 2014 Primary Election, and Friends of Mike Boudreaux for Sheriff 2014 was his candidate controlled committee. Mike Boudreaux and Friends of Mike Boudreaux for Sheriff 2014 failed to file five 24-hour reports, in violation of Government Code Section 84203 (5 counts). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$1,068.**
- 13. In the Matter of Salvador Contreras and Committee to Elect Salvador Contreras to City Treasurer – 2011; FPPC No. 13/1142.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Angela Brereton and Political Reform Consultant Teri Rindahl. Salvador Contreras was a successful candidate for Maywood City Treasurer in the November 8, 2011 General Election. He unsuccessfully ran for re-election to the same office in the November 3, 2011 General Election. Committee to Elect Contreras to City Treasurer – 2011 was Contreras' controlled committee and he was its treasurer. Contreras and Committee to Elect Salvador Contreras to City Treasurer - 2011 failed to timely file two semiannual campaign statements for the reporting periods of October 23, 2011 through December 31, 2011, and January 1, 2012 through June 30, 2012, in violation of Government Code Section 84200 (2 counts). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$423.**
- 14. In the Matter of Sonoma County Law Enforcement Association PAC and Damian Evans, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/2262.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Adrienne Korchmaros. Respondents Sonoma County Law Enforcement Association PAC and Damian Evans as Treasurer failed to timely file one semiannual statement Form 460 covering the period of October 19, 2014 through December 31, 2014, in violation of Government Code Section 84200 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$271.**

**15. In the Matter of Friends of Saugus Schools – Yes on EE and Louis G. Varga, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/1621.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Jeanette Turvill. Friends of Saugus Schools, Yes on EE, was a primarily formed local ballot measure committee. Measure EE was on the ballot at the November 4, 2014 General Election. Friends of Saugus Schools – Yes on EE and Varga, failed to timely file a semiannual campaign statement for the reporting period of January 1, 2015 through June 30, 2015, in violation of Government Code Section 84200 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

### **Lobbying Reporting**

**16. In the Matter of California-Hawaii State Conference of the NAACP; FPPC No. 14/1350.** Staff: Assistant Chief of Enforcement Dave Bainbridge and Law Clerk Sean Creadick. California-Hawaii State Conference of the NAACP is a lobbyist employer who failed to timely file three lobbyist employer reports for the reporting periods of October 1, 2013 through December 31, 2013, April 1, 2014 through June 30, 2014, and October 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014, in violation of Government Code Sections 86115, 86116, and 86117 (3 counts). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$3,000.**

**17. In the Matter of Stoneriver Pharmacy Solutions; FPPC No. 14/1081.** Staff: Assistant Chief of Enforcement Dave Bainbridge and Law Clerk Sean Creadick. Helios/Stoneriver Pharmacy Solutions is a lobbyist employer formed on January 1, 2013. Helios/Stoneriver Pharmacy Solutions failed to timely file two lobbyist employer reports for the reporting periods of January 1, 2014 through March 31, 2014, and October 1, 2014 through December 31, 2014, in violation of Government Code Section 86115 (2 counts). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$799.**

### **Statement of Economic Interests – Non-Filer**

**18. In the Matter of Jose Molina; FPPC No. 14/1328.** Staff: Assistant Chief of Enforcement Dave Bainbridge and Law Clerk Sean Creadick. Jose Molina, a former Alternate Commissioner of the Los Angeles Gateway Region Integrated Regional Water Management Authority, failed to timely file a 2013 Annual Statement of Economic Interests, in violation of Government Code Section 87300 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**19. In the Matter of Logan Carnell, FPPC No. 15/1203.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Adrienne Korchmaros. Logan Carnell, as a Board Member on the North Tahoe Fire Protection District, failed to timely file an Assuming Office Statement of Economic

Interests covering the period of January 1, 2014 through January 1, 2015, in violation of Government Code Section 87300 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**20. In the Matter of Frank Chavez; FPPC No. 16/028.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Teri Rindahl. Frank Chavez, as a Member with the Santa Clara County Alum Rock Union Elementary School District, failed to timely file a 2014 Annual Statement of Economic Interests, in violation of Government Code Section 87300 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**21. In the Matter of David Schwarz; FPPC No. 15/1584.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Teri Rindahl. David Schwarz, as a Commissioner with the Little Hoover Commission, failed to timely file a 2014 Annual Statement of Economic Interests, in violation of Government Code Section 87300 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$300.**

**22. In the Matter of Mary Bartlett; FPPC No. 16/051.** Staff: Political Reform Consultant Teri Rindahl. Mary Bartlett, as a Board Member with the Santa Clara County Fairgrounds Management Corporation, failed to timely file a 2014 Annual Statement of Economic Interests, in violation of Government Code Section 87300 (1 count). **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

#### **Annual Fee**

**23. In the Matter of Esterlina Lugo for City Council; FPPC No. 15/822** Staff: Commission Counsel Michael W. Hamilton. Esterlina Lugo, candidate for City Council member of Bell Gardens, failed to pay the 2013 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**24. In the Matter of Sachs for City Council 2014 and Ed Sachs, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/2143** Staff: Commission Counsel Michael W. Hamilton. Ed Sachs, candidate for Mission Viejo City Council, failed to pay the 2014 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**25. In the Matter of Asian Pacific American Democratic Club and James Lau, Treasurer; FPPC 15/2146** Staff: Commission Counsel Michael W. Hamilton. Asian Pacific American Democratic Club, a state general purpose committee, and James Lau

failed to pay the 2014 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**26. In the Matter of Mario Chavez for L.A. City Council 2015 and Michelle Moore Sanders, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/2177.** Staff: Senior Commission Counsel Bridgette Castillo. Mario Chavez, an unsuccessful candidate for L.A. City Council, Mario Chavez for L.A. City Council 2015 and Michelle Moore Sanders failed to pay the 2014 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**27. In the Matter of Juli Costanzo for San Gabriel City Council 2015 and Cheryl Weissend, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/2261** Staff: Commission Counsel Michael W. Hamilton. Juli Costanzo, candidate for San Gabriel City Council, and Cheryl Weissend failed to pay the 2014 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

**28. In the Matter of Ron Rowlett for City Council 2012 and Ben Espinoza, Treasurer; FPPC No. 15/2270** Staff: Commission Counsel Michael W. Hamilton. Ron Rowlett, member of the Vacaville City Council, and Ben Espinoza failed to pay the 2014 \$50 annual fee to the Secretary of State's Office, in violation of Government Code Section 84101.5. **Total Proposed Penalty: \$200.**

#### **General Items 29-31**

**29. Assignment of Hearing to Administrative Law Judge (ALJ): In the Matter of Rabbi Nachum Shifren and Committee to Elect Rabbi Shifren; FPPC No. 14/1109.** Staff: Chief of Enforcement Galena West and Senior Commission Counsel Angela Brereton. The Executive Director and the Chief of Enforcement are recommending that a hearing be conducted before an ALJ pursuant to Section 11512, subdivision (a). The ALJ will make a recommendation to the Commission on the findings of fact, law and penalty, if applicable, in the matter. The Commission will then have the opportunity to make the final determination on the case. If the Commission agrees with this recommendation, no action is required.

Neither the Commissioners nor the Chair asked any questions regarding this matter.

**30. Amend Regulation 18239, Lobbying Definition: Ride-Along Exception** Staff: Hyla Wagner, General Counsel, and Heather Rowan, Senior Commission Counsel. Staff

proposes that the Commission amend Regulation 18239. A lobbyist is defined as any individual who receives \$2,000 or more in a calendar month or whose principal duties as an employee are to communicate directly with a qualifying official to influence legislative or administrative action. Regulation 18239 provides an exception, known as the ride-along exception, to what activity qualifies as “direct communication” and therefore who qualifies as a lobbyist. The proposed amendments seek to curb potential abuses by clarifying this narrow exception applies only to employees who are subject matter experts who attend meetings with a lobbyist to add substantive information on a particular issue.

No public comment on this matter.

Commissioner Wasserman asked a question about the limited exception currently not applying to outside consultants hired by lobbyist employers.

Senior Commissioner Counsel Heather Rowan said the language in the regulation allowed for ambiguity even though most people had an understanding of the scope. This regulation clarifies who can ride-along and eliminates the ambiguity.

Commissioner Wynne made a motion to approve item 30; Commissioner Audero seconded the motion.

Ayes: Commissioner Audero, Wynne and Chair Remke.

Nays: Commissioner Wasserman.

The motion passed 3 to 1.

- 31. Legislative Update for March 2016.** Staff: Phillip Ung, Legislative and External Affairs Director. The Legislature began the second year of the 2015-2016 session on January 4, 2016. This report includes a summary of the 24 bills and one constitutional amendment currently pending that would impact the Political Reform Act and Government Code Section 1090.

The first five of the 24 bills were discussed individually because they had recommendations.

Commissioner Wynne asked whether or not members of the Legislature approach the FPPC before they put forth bills regarding the Political Reform Act.

Legislative and External Affairs Director Phillip Ung said that it is pretty rare. He is hoping that his presence here will change that practice and that they will proactively

reach out to us. He also said that as soon as we see language on a bill, he reaches out to their offices.

**AB 2250 Recommendation: Support**

No questions from Commissioners or Chair, and no public comment.

**AB 2558 Recommendation: Support**

Public comment—

Anthony Newman, San Bernardino County Board of Supervisors, in strong support of the bill.

Commissioner Wynne asked what it would look like if ten other counties asked the FPPC for a similar arrangement.

Executive Director Erin Peth said that we are open to it, but that it is up to local jurisdictions to decide.

**AB 700 Recommendation: Oppose unless amended**

Chair Remke stated that our concern has always been implementation of the bill.

Chair Remke outlined the timeline of the Commission's attempts to work with the author's office and the lack of response. Director Ung said the letter from the author's office stating they are open to amending the bill was an unexpected development.

Commissioner Wynne asked when the deadline is for the bill to be out of policy committee.

Director Ung said it was introduced last year, and is now in second house and has a few more months. Senate Elections Committee doesn't plan on hearing it until June so we still have time to work with the author's office.

Public Comment-

4707 identical emails were received expressing concern with the Commission's position on this bill.

Craig Dunkerley, California Clean Money Campaign, said that he hopes the Commission would remain neutral on the bill.

**AB 1200 Recommendation: Oppose**

Chair Remke expressed her ongoing concerns with this bill and believes that staff's report highlights the issues.

Commissioner Wynne stated that when you see a bill about "disclosure," she hopes the FPPC could support it, but doesn't believe the bill in its current shape to achieve the stated goals nor are we the right agency to regulate the procurement process as proposed.

Commissioner Wasserman discussed the overlap between the FPPC's current role as far as conflicts of interest and other ethical issues we oversee for state government with the proposal in this bill to expand the scope to the procurement process. He encouraged ongoing dialogue in this area.

Director Ung said that we are an agency with limited resources and cannot be the one-stop-shop for all things disclosure and transparency for all issues of state government.

Commissioner Audero asked what Department of General Services (DGS) thinks about this and whether or not anyone has reached out to them.

Chair Remke said that we can't speak on behalf of DGS, but that our staff has been in contact with the department to discuss concerns.

**Public Comment—**

Assemblymember Rich Gordon, District 24, stated that he is carrying the bill because the state of California authorized \$11 billion in procurement contracts last year. He doesn't believe that this bill would insert the Commission into the procurement process, but rather expand on what the Commission already does. He said that the Secretary of State supports this bill. He said that his office has had discussion with DGS who hasn't expressed any concerns and have taken no position on this bill. He asked that the Commission take no position and abstain on this matter.

Nicholas Heidorn, California Common Cause, said that they view this as a disclosure bill more so than a procurement bill and are in support of it.

Trudy Schafer, League of Women Voters of California, said that they are supportive of the bill and would hope the Commission would consider being neutral on the bill.

**AB 1582 Recommendation: Oppose**

No public comment.

Director Ung says that the author's office said the intent of the bill is to have information reported regularly and not activity-based, future amendments will reflect that.

Commissioner Wynne made a motion to approve the five recommendations provided by staff; Commissioner Audero seconded the motion.

Ayes: Commissioners Audero, Wasserman, Wynne and Chair Remke.  
The motion passed 4 to 0.

**Executive Staff Reports Item 32**

**32. Executive Staff Reports.**

Enforcement Division. Galena West, Enforcement Chief  
Legal Division. Hyla P. Wagner, General Counsel  
External Affairs and Education. Tara Stock, Manager

The staff reports were submitted.

Chair Remke made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Wynne seconded the motion.

Ayes: Commissioners Audero, Wasserman, Wynne, and Chair Remke  
The motion passed 4 to 0.

The meeting adjourned at 11:10 am.

Respectfully Submitted,

Sheva Tabatabaiejad  
Commission Assistant  
Approved April 11, 2016

Joann Remke, Chair  
Fair Political Practices Commission