1 2	GALENA WEST Chief of Enforcement JENNA C. RINEHART Commission Counsel FAIR POLITICAL PRACTICES COMMISSION 1102 Q Street, Suite 3000					
3						
4	Sacramento, CA 95811 Telephone: (916) 323-6302					
5	Email: JRinehart@fppc.ca.gov					
6	Attamanya fan Camulainaut					
7	Attorneys for Complainant Enforcement Division of the Fair Political Practices Commission					
8						
9	BEFORE THE FAIR POLITICAL PRACTICES COMMISSION					
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA					
11	In the Matter of:	FPPC Case No. 18/762				
12 13	BETTER MILLBRAE and ALAN R. WONG,	STIPULATION, DECISION AND ORDER				
14	Respondents.					
15						
16						
17	INTR	RODUCTION				
18	Respondent, Better Millbrae (the "Committee") (ID# 1405207), identified itself as a county					
19	general purpose committee on its initial statemen	nt of organization. This statement also reported the				
20	Committee was formed to "promote general awa	areness and civic involvement in order to promote a				
21	better living environment for City of Millbrae and County of San Mateo." At all relevant times,					
22	Respondent, Alan R. Wong ("Wong"), served as the Committee's treasurer.					
23	The Political Reform Act (the "Act") ¹ re-	quires committees and treasurers to amend its statement				
24	of organization whenever there has been a chang	ge in the information reported and to timely file				
25	campaign statements. The Committee and Wong	g violated the Act by failing to timely amend its				
26						
27 28	¹ The Political Reform Act – sometimes simply referred to as the Act – is contained in Government Code sections 81000 through 91014. All statutory references are to this code. The regulations of the Fair Political Practices Commission ar contained in Sections 18110 through 18997 of Title 2 of the California Code of Regulations. All regulatory references are to this source.					
		1				

12 13

14

15 16

17 18

19 20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

statement of organization to identify the Committee as a sponsored committee and by failing to timely file a semi-annual campaign statement.

SUMMARY OF THE LAW

The Act and its regulations are amended from time to time. The violations in this case occurred in 2018. For this reason, all legal references and discussions of law pertain to the Act's provisions as they existed at that time.

Need for Liberal Construction and Vigorous Enforcement of the Political Reform Act

When enacting the Act, the people of California found and declared that previous laws regulating political practices suffered from inadequate enforcement by state and local authorities.² Thus, it was decreed the Act "should be liberally construed to accomplish its purposes.³ A central purpose of the Act is to promote transparency by ensuring that receipts and expenditures in election campaigns are fully and truthfully disclosed so that voters are fully informed and improper practices are inhibited.⁴ Another purpose of the Act is to provide adequate enforcement mechanisms so that the Act will be "vigorously enforced."5

Statement of Organization

If there is a change in any of the information contained in a statement of organization, an amendment shall be filed within 10 days to reflect the change. The committee shall file the original of the amendment with the Secretary of State and shall also file a copy of the amendment with the local filing officer with whom the committee is required to file its campaign statements.⁷

In the case of a sponsored committee, the name of the committee shall include the name of its sponsor. Under the Act, "sponsored committee" means a committee that has one or more sponsors. A person sponsors a committee if the committee receives 80 percent or more of its contributions from the ///

² Section 81001, subdivision (h).

³ Section 81003.

⁴ Section 81002, subdivision (a).

⁵ Section 81002, subdivision (f).

⁶ Section 84103.

⁸ Section 84102, subdivision (a) and Regulation 18419, subdivision (b)(1). ⁹ Section 82048.7, subdivision (a).

11

12

1314

1516

17

18 19

2021

2223

///

24

25

26

27

28

person.¹⁰ "Person" means an individual, company, corporation, limited liability company, and any other organization or group of persons acting in concert.¹¹

County vs. City General Purpose Committee

A *county* general purpose committee is a committee to support or oppose candidates or measures voted on in only one county, or in more than one jurisdiction within one county. A *city* general purpose committee is a committee to support or oppose candidates or measures voted on in only one city. 3

Campaign Statements; Where to File

City general purpose committees shall file the original and one copy of the campaign statements with the clerk of the city and are not required to file with the local elections official of the county in which they are domiciled.¹⁴

Period Covered

"Period covered" by a campaign statement means the period beginning the day after the closing date of the most recent campaign statement which was required to be filed and ending with the closing date of the statement in question.¹⁵ If a person has not previously filed a campaign statement within the calendar year, the period covered begins on January 1.¹⁶

Semi-Annual Campaign Statements

A recipient committee shall file semi-annual campaign statements each year no later than July 31 for the period ending June 30, and no later than January 31 for the period ending December 31.¹⁷

Contents of Campaign Statements

If the cumulative amount of contributions received from a person is \$100 or more and a contribution has been received from that person during the period covered by the campaign statement, then the campaign statement shall contain the following contributor information: full name; street

¹⁰ Section 82048.7, subdivision (b)(1).

¹¹ Section 82047.

¹² Section 82027.5, subdivision (c).

¹³ Section 82027.5, subdivision (d).

¹⁴ Section 84215, subdivision (d).

¹⁵ Section 82046, subdivision (b).

 $^{^{16}}$ *Id*.

¹⁷ Section 84200.

address; occupation; name of employer; date and amount received; and cumulative amount of contributions.¹⁸

For each person to whom an expenditure of \$100 or more has been made during the period covered by the campaign statement, the campaign statement shall contain the following information: full name; street address; amount of expenditure; description of expenditure.

"Street address" means the street name and building number, and the city, state, and zip code. 19 Joint and Several Liability of Committee and Treasurer

It is the duty of a committee treasurer to ensure the committee complies with the Act. ²⁰ A treasurer may be held jointly and severally liable, along with the committee and candidate, for violations committed by the committee.²¹

Liability for Violations

Any person who violates any provision of the Act, who purposely or negligently causes any other person to violate any provision of the Act, or who aids and abets any other person in the violation of any provision of the Act, is liable for administrative penalties up to \$5,000 per violation.²²

SUMMARY OF THE FACTS

This case was opened as a result of two sworn complaints alleging the Committee did not file certain campaign statements. After reviewing the Committee's campaign filings, the Enforcement Division discovered other reporting deficiencies that were later corrected in amended statements filed in conjunction with this settlement.

On April 20, 2018, the Committee and Wong filed an initial statement of organization with the Secretary of State. According to the Committee's campaign statements, the Committee received approximately \$27,950 in contributions and paid approximately \$26,981 in expenditures throughout 2018.

///

25 26

27

28

¹⁸ Section 84211, subdivision (f). ¹⁹ Regulation 18421.2.

²⁰ Sections 81004, 84100, and Regulation 18427.

²¹ Sections 83116. 5 and 91006.

²² Sections 83116 and 83116. 5.

STATEMENT OF ORGANIZATION

Failure to Timely File Amended Statement of Organization

On April 20, 2018, the Committee and Wong filed an initial statement of organization with the Secretary of State reporting the Committee had not yet qualified as a committee and had no sponsors. This statement reported the Committee as a county general purpose committee active in San Mateo and San Francisco County.

On September 10, 2018, the Committee and Wong filed an amended statement of organization with the Secretary of State reporting the Committee qualified as a committee on May 22, 2018. This statement reported the Committee as a county general purpose committee active in the City of Millbrae and sponsored by Boca Lake Retail, Inc.

Since the Committee qualified as a committee on May 22, 2018, it was required to file a qualifying statement of organization by June 1, 2018. The Committee and Wong were 101 days late in filing the qualifying statement of organization with the Secretary of State. This violation will not be charged separately, for purposes of settlement, but will be used as aggravating circumstances.

Failure to File Amended Statement of Organization to Include Sponsor in Committee's Name

On the Committee's semi-annual campaign statement for the reporting period of January 1, 2018 through June 30, 2018, the Committee reported receiving a total of \$25,100 in contributions as follows:

DATE	CONTRIBUTOR	AMOUNT
05/07/2018	Wong	\$100
05/22/2018	Boca Lake Retail, Inc	\$10,000
06/05/2018	Boca Lake Retail, Inc	\$15,000
	TOTAL:	\$25,100

On the Committee's semi-annual campaign statement for the reporting period of July 1, 2018 through December 31, 2018, the Committee reported receiving a total of \$2,850 in contributions. Boca Lake Retail, Inc. did not make any contributions during this reporting period.

As of May 22, 2018, Boca Lake Retail, Inc. contributed 99% of the total contributions received by the Committee (\$10,000 / \$10,100 = 0.990). Throughout, 2018, the Committee received approximately 89% of its total contributions from Boca Lake Retail, Inc. (\$25,000 / \$27,950 = 0.894).

Since the Committee met the 80% threshold to be considered a sponsored committee on May 22, 2018, it was required to file an amended statement of organization to change the Committee's name to include the name of its sponsor, Boca Lake Retail, Inc., by the June 1, 2018 deadline. On September 10, 2018, the Committee filed an amended statement of organization with the Secretary of State reporting the Committee was sponsored by Boca Lake Retail, Inc. but failed to change the Committee's name to include the name of its sponsor. However, an amended statement of organization has been filed as part of this settlement agreement to include the sponsor's name in the Committee's name.

County vs. City General Purpose Committee

Following the Committee's establishment, all expenditures made were to oppose a city development, the Gateway at Millbrae Station Project. Throughout 2018, the Committee reported the following expenditures made:

PAYEE	DESCRIPTION	AMOUNT
Bern Steves	Professional Services	\$5,631
CA Business Law Office		\$13,554
Andre Charles	Campaign consultants	\$4,000
Damon Suen	Petition circulating	\$120
MJ Zanzonella		\$417
R. Finley		\$432
R. Usitald		\$1,256
C. Lueng		\$120
A. Zhang		\$120
Amy Wong		\$120
Eugenia Wong		\$120
Charles Mee		\$360
B. Suon	Campaign literature	\$456
Freeman Peng	Polling and survey research	\$125
	TOTAL:	\$26,831

In 2019, the Committee reported receiving \$0 in contributions and spending \$50 on expenditures. The \$50 expenditure is reported as being for "State FPPC Annual Fee."

Since all of the expenditures made to date have been to oppose a local city development project, the Committee is a *city* general purpose committee rather than a *county* general purpose committee. An amended statement of organization has been filed as part of this settlement agreement to change the Committee's jurisdiction. This violation will not be charged separately, for purposes of settlement, but

will be used as aggravating circumstances since this distinction changes where the Committee's statements are filed.

SEMI-ANNUAL CAMPAIGN STATEMENT

Failure to Timely File Semi-Annual Campaign Statement

On September 6, 2018, 37 days late, the Committee and Wong filed the semi-annual campaign statement for the reporting period of April 22, 2018 through June 30, 2018 with the City of Millbrae. This statement reported \$25,100 received in contributions and \$12,702 spent on expenditures. On September 25, 2018, the Committee filed an amended semi-annual campaign statement correcting the reporting period to January 1, 2018 through June 30, 2018.

On January 8, 2019, the Committee and Wong timely filed the semi-annual campaign statement for the reporting period of July 1, 2018 through December 31, 2018. On July 31, 2019, the Committee and Wong timely filed the semi-annual campaign statement for the reporting period of January 1, 2019 through June 30, 2019.

Failure to Report Required Contributor Information

Throughout 2018, the Committee reported receiving approximately \$27,950 in contributions. The Committee failed to report required contributor information for four contributions received totaling \$2,306. This amounts to approximately 8% of the total contributions received (\$2,306 / \$27,950 = 0.083).

Throughout 2018, the Committee reported spending approximately \$26,981 on expenditures. The Committee failed to report required vendor information for 12 expenditures made totaling \$3,771. This amounts to approximately 14% of the total expenditures made (\$3,771 / \$26,981 = 0.139).

For purposes of settlement, this violation will not be charged separately but will be used as aggravating circumstances. Also, amended semi-annual campaign statements have been filed as part of this settlement agreement to include the missing contributor/vendor information.

27

/// 28

_

VIOLATIONS

Count 1: Failure to Timely File Amended Statement of Organization

The Committee and Wong failed to timely file an amended statement of organization to change the Committee's name to include the name of its sponsor by the June 1, 2018 deadline, in violation of Government Code Sections 84102 and 84103 and Regulation 18419.

Count 2: Failure to Timely File Semi-Annual Campaign Statement

The Committee and Wong failed to timely file the semi-annual campaign statement, for the reporting period of January 1, 2018 through June 30, 2018, by the July 31, 2018 deadline, in violation of Government Code Section 84200.

PROPOSED PENALTY

This matter consists of two counts. The maximum penalty that may be imposed is \$5,000 per count. Thus, the maximum penalty that may be imposed here is \$10,000.²³

In determining the appropriate penalty for a particular violation of the Act, the Commission considers the facts of the case, the public harm involved, and the purposes of the Act. Further, the Commission considers factors such as: (a) the seriousness of the violation; (b) the presence or absence of any intention to conceal, deceive or mislead; (c) whether the violation was deliberate, negligent or inadvertent; (d) whether the violation was isolated or part of a pattern; (e) whether corrective amendments voluntarily were filed to provide full disclosure; and (f) whether the violator has a prior record of violations.²⁴

The public harm inherent in failing to disclose a sponsor of a committee is that the public is deprived of information regarding who is providing the committee financial support. The seriousness of failing to timely file an amended statement of organization to include the sponsor's name in the Committee's name here is mitigated because the Committee did file an amended statement of organization and reported Boca Lake Retail, Inc. as the Committee's sponsor. However, this statement was filed late and the Committee failed to change its name so the sponsorship would not be obvious to the public.

²³ Section 83116, subdivision (c).

²⁴ Regulation 18361. 5, subdivision (d).

28 | ///

The public harm inherent in campaign reporting violations is that the public is deprived of important, time-sensitive information regarding campaign activity. Generally, these types of violations are considered more serious when the public is deprived of information that was required to be disclosed prior to an election because this has the potential to affect how votes are cast. The seriousness of failing to timely file a campaign statement here is mitigated because the Committee failed to timely file a post-election semi-annual campaign statement and the information was not required to be disclosed prior to an election.

In this case, there was no evidence to support an intent to conceal, deceive or mislead the public as to the Committee's status as a sponsored committee or to the Committee's receipts and expenditures. The violations here do not appear to be deliberate as the Committee and Wong were not sophisticated with the Act. The violations committed here were isolated as the Committee and Wong have not had prior enforcement history. Respondents state they did not have the benefit of a professional treasurer or campaign consultant. Also, the Committee and Wong cooperated with the Enforcement Division and filed all required statements.

The Commission considers penalties in prior cases with the same or similar violations and comparable facts.

Count 1: Failure to Timely File Amended Statement of Organization

In the Matter of Apple Valley Professional Firefighters Association Local 4742, James Peratt, and Larry Soper; FPPC Case No. 16/19935. Respondents, a city general purpose committee, its principal officer, and treasurer, committed numerous violations of the Act including failing to properly name and identify the committee as primarily formed to support a local ballot measure, Measure A. In 2016, the Committee reported receiving \$20,334 in contributions and making \$32,816 in expenditures. At the end of September of 2016, the Committee had spent more than 70% of its expenditures on Measure A and so was required to file an amended statement of organization to change the Committee type to primarily formed ballot measure committee and to include that information in the Committee's name. The Committee failed to file an amended statement of organization. On August 15, 2019, the Commission approved a penalty of \$3,500 for this count.

A lesser penalty than that approved in the *Firefighters* case is recommended. Similar to Firefighters, the Committee and Wong failed to file an amended statement of organization to change the Committee's name to include the Committee's sponsor. In mitigation, the Committee and Wong did file, 71 days late, an amended statement of organization to disclose the Committee's sponsor information but failed to change the Committee's name. In aggravation, the Committee and Wong were 101 days late in filing its qualifying statement of organization. Therefore, a penalty of \$2,500 is recommended.

Count 2: Failure to Timely File Semi-Annual Campaign Statement

In the Matter of Mister Phillips for School Board 2016 and Mister Phillips; FPPC Case No. 17/944. Respondents, a successful candidate for a school board of education and his controlled committee, failed to timely file two semi-annual campaign statements. The first late-filed semi-annual campaign statement, for the reporting period of October 23, 2016 to December 31, 2016, was filed 252 days late and reported \$17,058 in contributions and \$28,571 in expenditures. The second late-filed semiannual campaign statement, for the reporting of January 1, 2017 to June 30, 2017, was filed 71 days late and reported -\$234 in contributions and \$2,670.45 in expenditures. Throughout 2016, the Committee received a total of \$48,097 in contributions and made a total of \$49,808 in expenditures. On November 15, 2018, the Commission approved a penalty of \$2,000.

A lesser penalty than that approved in the *Phillips* case is recommended. Unlike *Phillips*, the Committee and Wong failed to timely file only one semi-annual campaign statement and failed to report contributor/vendor information for contributions received and expenditures made. Similar to *Phillips*, the late-filed semi-annual campaign statement was filed 37 days late and reported \$25,100 received in contributions and \$12,702 spent on expenditures. In aggravation, the Committee and Wong failed to report required vendor information for seven expenditures worth approximately \$2,926. This amounts to approximately 23% of the total expenditures made for this reporting period. Therefore, a penalty of \$1,500 is recommended.

26

27

28

///

Under these circumstances, it is respectfully submitted that imposition of an agreed upon penalty in the amount of \$4,000 is justified, as reflected in the chart below:

Count	Violation	Penalty
1	Failure to Timely File Amended Statement of Organization	\$2,500
2	Failure to Timely File Semi-Annual Campaign Statement	\$1,500
	TOTAL:	\$4,000

CONCLUSION

Complainant, the Enforcement Division of the Fair Political Practices Commission, and Respondents, Better Millbrae and Alan R. Wong hereby agree as follows:

- 1. Respondents violated the Act as described in the foregoing pages, which are a true and accurate summary of the facts in this matter.
- 2. This stipulation will be submitted for consideration by the Fair Political Practices Commission at its next regularly scheduled meeting or as soon thereafter as the matter may be heard.
- 3. This stipulation resolves all factual and legal issues raised in this matter for the purpose of reaching a final disposition without the necessity of holding an administrative hearing to determine the liability of Respondents pursuant to Section 83116.
- 4. Respondents understand, and hereby knowingly and voluntarily waive, any and all procedural rights set forth in Sections 83115.5, 11503, 11523, and Regulations 18361.1 through 18361.9. This includes, but is not limited to the right to appear personally at any administrative hearing held in this matter, to be represented by an attorney at Respondents' own expense, to confront and cross-examine all witnesses testifying at the hearing, to subpoena witnesses to testify at the hearing, to have an impartial administrative law judge preside over the hearing as a hearing officer, and to have the matter judicially reviewed.
- 5. Respondents agree to the issuance of the decision and orders set forth below. Also, Respondents agree to the Commission imposing against them an administrative penalty in the amount of \$4,000. One or more cashier's checks or money orders totaling said amount to be paid to the General Fund of the State of California is/are submitted with this stipulation as full

- 1			
1	payment of the administrative penalty described above, and same shall be held by the State of		
2	California until the Commission issues its decision and order regarding this matter.		
3	6. If the Commission refuses to approve this stipulation – then this stipulation shall become		
4	null and void, and within fifteen business days after the Commission meeting at which the		
5	stipulation is rejected, all payments tendered by Respondents in connection with this stipulation		
6	shall be reimbursed to Respondents. If this stipulation is not approved by the Commission, and if		
7	a full evidentiary hearing before the Commission becomes necessary, neither any member of the		
8	Commission, nor the Executive Director, shall be disqualified because of prior consideration of		
9	this stipulation.		
10	7. The parties to this agreement may execute their respective signature pages separately. A		
11	copy of any party's executed signature page, including a hardcopy of a signature page		
12	transmitted via fax or as a PDF email attachment, is as effective and binding as the original.		
13			
14	Dated:		
15	Galena West, Chief of Enforcement Fair Political Practices Commission		
16			
17	Dated:		
18	Alan R. Wong, individually and on behalf of Better Millbrae, Respondents		
19			
20			
21	The foregoing stipulation of the parties "In the Matter of Better Millbrae and Alan R. Wong,"		
22	FPPC Case No. 18/762, is hereby accepted as the final decision and order of the Fair Political Practices		
23	Commission, effective upon execution by the Chair.		
24			
25	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
26			
27	Dated: Richard C. Miadich, Chair		
28	Fair Political Practices Commission		
	12		
- 1	$1 \angle$		