



STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FAIR POLITICAL PRACTICES COMMISSION
1102 Q Street • Suite 3050 • Sacramento, CA 95811

December 11, 2023

City of Turlock
c/o Douglas White, City Attorney
156 S. Broadway, Suite 240
Turlock, CA 95380
Via email only: cityattorney@turlock.ca.us

Advisory Letter Re: FPPC No. 2020-00960; City of Turlock

Dear City of Turlock:

The Enforcement Division of the Fair Political Practices Commission (the “Commission”) enforces the provisions of the Political Reform Act (the “Act”).¹ This letter is in response to a commission-initiated case regarding whether the City of Turlock sent prohibited campaign-related mailings at public expense by sending a mailer and posting information on a website regarding Measure A. The Enforcement Division completed its investigation and decided to close its file on this matter without prosecution.

The Act prohibits sending a newsletter or other mass mailing at public expense.² Specifically, mass mailing is prohibited if (1) the item is a tangible item; (2) the item expressly advocates the qualification, passage, or defeat of a clearly identified measure, or unambiguously urges a particular result in an election; (3) public moneys are paid to distribute the item, or to prepare the item, for more than \$50, with the intent of sending the item; and (4) more than 200 substantially similar items are sent during the course of an election.³ This prohibition limits the public subsidy of political campaigns, which would grant an unfair advantage to governmental bodies that desire to use public resources in pursuit of favorable election results.

An item unambiguously urges a particular result in an election in one of two ways: (1) when it clearly is campaign material or campaign activity because it is related to an election and it is an item such as bumper stickers, billboards, door-to-door canvassing, posters, advertising “floats,” or mass media advertising;⁴ or (2) when the style, tenor, and timing of the communication can be reasonably characterized as campaign material and not a fair presentation of facts serving only an informational purpose.⁵

¹ The Political Reform Act is contained in Government Code sections 81000 through 91014, and all statutory references are to this code. The regulations of the Fair Political Practices Commission are contained in sections 18104 through 18998 of Title 2 of the California Code of Regulations, and all regulatory references are to this source.

² Section 89001.

³ Regulation 18901.1, subd. (a).

⁴ Regulation 18901.1, subd. (c)(1).

⁵ Regulation 18901.1, subd. (c)(2).

A payment of public moneys by a local governmental agency made in connection with a communication, whether it is a mass mailing or not, that expressly advocates passage of a ballot measure, or that taken as a whole and in context, unambiguously urges a particular result in an election is an independent expenditure.⁶ Any person or combination of persons who, in a calendar year, makes independent expenditures totaling \$1,000 or more qualifies as an independent expenditure committee.⁷ An independent expenditure committee must file semi-annual campaign statements each year for the period ending June 30 and December 31 if it made independent expenditures during the 6-month period prior to those dates.⁸ Further, an independent expenditure committee must report its late independent expenditures within 24 hours of the time they are made to the appropriate filing officers.⁹

Our review and investigation found that the mailer and the website www.cityofturlock.org/MeasureA did not contain express words of advocacy. The mailer and the website were generally informational, not argumentative, and moderate in tone. However, parts of the website came close to meeting the standard of unambiguously urging a particular result in an election. For example, the website included quoted language from Ordinance No. 1281-CS providing reasons to place Measure A on the ballot to secure needed funding but did not include information regarding any potential negative financial impact. Additionally, Measure A successfully passed in the November 2020 election. However, the statements in the mailer and on the website are not sufficiently inflammatory and argumentative to conclude that either constituted campaign activity rather than informational material. Thus, the Enforcement Division cannot conclude that the mailings or the website violated the Act's prohibition against campaign mailers at public expense. Therefore, we are closing this matter with this advisory letter.

Although we are closing our file, please be advised of the provisions in the Act and regulations regarding campaign-related communications. If you need additional guidance, you may contact the Commission's Advice team by sending an email to advice@fppc.ca.gov. There is also information pertaining to campaign-related communications and advertisement disclosure requirements available on the Commission's website at www.fppc.ca.gov and www.fppc.ca.gov/learn/campaign-rules/campaign-related-communications-at-public-expense.html.

Should you have any questions regarding this letter, please feel free to contact me at vjimmy@fppc.ca.gov or (279) 237-5971.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Jimmy
Commission Counsel, Enforcement Division

⁶ Section 82031; Regulation 18420.1, subd. (a).

⁷ Section 82013, subd. (b).

⁸ Section 84200, subd. (b).

⁹ Section 84204.